Does the clinical benefit of performance measures justify the administrative burden? The Case Against

Leah Marcotte, MD, MS

Assistant Professor
Division of General Internal Medicine, Department of Medicine
University of Washington
November 3, 2023

https://teespring.com/shop/i-love-metrics?pid=2&cid=2122

Measure Specifications

Description	*What is the measure measuring?*
Numerator	*Criteria for meeting measure*
Denominator	*Criteria for measure eligibility*
Denominator exclusions	*Criteria for measure ineligibility*
Rationale	*On what guidelines/evidence is this measure based?*

Adapted from: https://mmshub.cms.gov/sites/default/files/Guide-Quality-Measures-How-They-Are-Developed-Used-Maintained.pdf

Measure Validity

https://tinyurl.com/p9mtar7j; Photo credit: Kunakorn Rassadornyindee

Are performance measures valid?

Perspective

Time Out — Charting a Path for Improving Performance Measurement

Catherine H. MacLean, M.D., Ph.D., Eve A. Kerr, M.D., M.P.H., and Amir Qaseem, M.D., Ph.D., M.H.A.

Measure Reliability

https://tinyurl.com/ycy2ffyf; photo credit: baona

Are Performance Measures Reliable?

Original Research | Published: 12 September 2017

Reliability of Physician-Level Measures of Patient Experience in Primary Care

Joshua J. Fenton MD, MPH ✉, Anthony Jerant MD, Richard L. Kravitz MD, MSPH, Klea D. Bertakis MD, MPH, Daniel J. Tancredi PhD, Elizabeth M. Magnan MD, PhD & Peter Franks MD

Journal of General Internal Medicine **32**, 1323–1329 (2017) | Cite this article

Are Performance Measures Reliable?

QUALITY IN THE CONTEXT OF VALUE: RELIABILITY OF QUALITY METRICS IN AN ACADEMIC HEALTH SYSTEM SHIFTING TOWARD VALUE-BASED PAYMENTS

Quality in the Context of Value

Reliability of Quality Metrics in an Academic Health System Shifting Toward Value-Based Payments

Schuttner, Linnaea MD, MS[1,2]; Reddy, Ashok MD, MSc[1,2]; White, Andrew A. MD[2]; Wong, Edwin S. PhD[1,3]; Liao, Joshua M. MD, MSc[2,3]

Author Information

American Journal of Medical Quality 35(6):p 465-473, December 2020. | **DOI:** 10.1177/1062860620917205

Are Performance Measures Reliable?

Original Investigation | Oncology

March 22, 2021

Evaluation of Reliability and Correlations of Quality Measures in Cancer Care

Nancy L. Keating, MD, MPH[1,2]; Jessica L. F. Cleveland, MS[3]; Alexi A. Wright, MD, MPH[4,5]; et al

» Author Affiliations | Article Information

JAMA Netw Open. 2021;4(3):e212474. doi:10.1001/jamanetworkopen.2021.2474

What else can go wrong?

Association of Coded Severity With Readmission Reduction After the Hospital Readmissions Reduction Program

Andrew M. Ibrahim, MD, MSc[1,2]; Justin B. Dimick, MD, MPH[1,2]; Shashank S. Sinha, MD, MSc[1,3]; John M. Hollingsworth, MD, MS[1,4]; Ushapoorna Nuliyalu, MPH[1]; Andrew M. Ryan, PhD[1,2,5]

» Author Affiliations | Article Information

JAMA Intern Med. 2018;178(2):290-292. doi:10.1001/jamainternmed.2017.6148

"Our findings raise concern that a substantial portion of estimated reductions in readmissions after implementation of the HRRP are the result of hospital documentation rather than underlying improvements in the delivery of care."

Are Pay-for-Performance programs working?

Research article | Open access | Published: 24 February 2021

Is the evidence on the effectiveness of pay for performance schemes in healthcare changing? Evidence from a meta-regression analysis

Arezou Zaresani ✉ & Anthony Scott

BMC Health Services Research **21**, Article number: 175 (2021) | Cite this article

"The evidence on the effectiveness of P4P schemes is evolving slowly, with little evidence that lessons are being learned concerning the design and evaluation of P4P schemes."

Summary

1. Many performance metrics currently used may not be a good reflection of actual performance
   - Validity
   - Reliability
   - “Gaming”
2. Data on pay-for-performance programs shows small effect size and no meaningful improvement over time

Photo from: https://equalitytrust.org.uk/blog/feral-debate-nites-guest-blog-drill-music